

## **FM REVIEW 2019 8 COMMENTS**

**COMMENTS TO EDITOR:** This essay focuses on a quality often in short supply in training, i.e., encouragement of learners at crucial points in their development, especially as researchers. Reviewers felt it was "uninspiring" and superficial, as well as overlooking other important characteristics of the learner, i.e., resiliency. While not disagreeing, I think the essay actually makes an important point. I feel the author should be given the opportunity to improve on the original submission.

**COMMENTS TO AUTHOR:** This essay focuses on a quality in mentors often in short supply in training, i.e., encouragement of learners at crucial points in their development, especially as researchers. We liked bringing this often-overlooked element to the forefront, and feel it is a good reminder to faculty mentors not to focus solely on the content of training but also on the process by which trainees become good doctors and researchers.

We would like you to undertake some revisions in order to improve the submission:

- 1) Please consider adding an introductory paragraph about the importance of encouragement in medical education and residency, acknowledging that it is not the only quality needed in faculty, but it is one often not considered sufficiently in the press of cramming as much content knowledge as possible into learners. Such a paragraph could effectively frame your two anecdotes.**
- 2) Please try to shorten the first anecdote about your own failure experience and the subsequent encouragement of Dr. Mohler. This is an important piece of the essay, but it is the background to the denouement, not the denouement itself, which is the resident's successful experience at the conference.**
- 3) In the paragraph which introduces the difficulties of residents having successful research experiences, you might briefly note that there are of course many other factors, both external and internal, that contribute to a successful outcome for residents, but that simple encouragement and belief in the resident is often neglected.**
- 4) Jane's experience at the conference is where all the threads of the essay come together. Yet it is not as inspiring as it could be. Pay attention to the writing to try to bring to life a bit more just what a wonderful experience this was for the resident; and how your encouragement throughout sustained her.**
- 5) The essay could benefit from a concluding sentence about what you learned about the value of encouragement .**

Although we are making several suggestions for revision of the ms, please try to keep the total count within the 1000 word limit. Thank you, and we look forward to a revision of this manuscript.